House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

Report

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected
Provincial Officials

November 29, 1990

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected Provincial Officials

Commissioners:

George M. Mitchell, Q.C.
George L. White, LL.B.

Secretary to the Commission:
Joan M. Kelly

Post Office Box 2630
Station "M"
Halifax, N.S.
B3J 3N5

424-4432

November 29, 1990

The Honourable Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker of the House of Assembly
Province House
Halifax, Nova Scotia

Dear Mr. Speaker:

We were appointed as Commissioners pursuant to S.55 of Chapter 210, Revised Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1989, to make an inquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.

Having completed our inquiry, in fulfillment of the commission assigned, we respectfully submit the accompanying report.

Yours sincerely,

George M. Mitchell

George L. White

91-01254/

NOVA SCOTIA

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

OF

REMUNERATION OF ELECTED

PROVINCIAL OFFICIALS

29 November 1990

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES; BACKGROUND CONSIDERATION	
	1. Basic Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for MLAs and Ministers	3
	2. Additional Payments to Members for Services in the House	4
	3. The Legislature and the Role of the M.L.A.	5
	4. Support for Legislators in Other Provinces	8
	5. Some Indicators of Recent Economic Changes in Nova Scotia	9
III.	REMUNERATION FOR MLAs	13
IV.	ADMINISTRATION AND SUPPORT, SERVICES AND FACILITIES FOR THE WORK OF PRIVATE MEMBERS AND OF CAUCUS OFFICES	16
V.	SUPPORT FOR LEADERS OF OPPOSITION PARTIES	20
VI.	SALARIES OF MEMBERS HOLDING OFFICE AND EXPENSES OF MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL	21
VII.	LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEES AND FACILITIES SUPPORTING THE HOUSE	24
VIII.	SALARIES FOR OFFICERS OF THE HOUSE	26
IX.	CONCLUSION	28
X.	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	29
XI.	SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS	30

INDEX TO TABLES IN THE REPORT

		Page
TABLE A	Acts Passed by the Legislature, Nova Scotia (1983-1990)	6
TABLE B	Comparison of Some Changes in Earnings, Public Sector, Nova Scotia	11
TABLE C	Summary Record of Salaries Paid to Designated Office Holders, 1986-1990	21
TABLE G-1	Summary Record of Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for MLAs, Salaried Members and Members of the Executive Council in Nova Scotia, 1983-1990	55
TABLE G-2	Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for Elected Members by Province 1990	56
TABLE G-3	Summary of Additional Remuneration for Particular Responsibilities and for Committee Service in the Legislature by Province	57
TABLE G-4	Sitting Days per Session of the Nova Scotia Legislature 1974-1990	58
TABLE G-5	Average Salaries of Selected Public Sector Groups, Nova Scotia 1974-1990	59
TABLE G-6	Consumer Price Index for Canada (All Items) 1981-1990	60

NOTE: Requests for additional copies of this Report and those of previous Commissioners may be made to the Office of the Speaker, House of Assembly, Halifax, Nova Scotia.

APPENDICES

		Page
A.	Footnotes	31
B.	Letter of Appointment of Commissioners with text of s. 55 of the *House of Assembly Act*	32
C.	Acknowledgements	34
D.	Internal Economy Board Regulations 1990	39
E.	Internal Economy Board Regulations 1990A	51
F.	Internal Economy Board Regulations 1990B	53
G.	Tables	55
H.	Principles relating to Remuneration and Support for Members and Ministers	61

I. INTRODUCTION

The *House of Assembly Act* by virtue of Section 55 provides that the Speaker shall, on or before the first day of October in each year, appoint persons to make an inquiry and a report respecting indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the *House of Assembly Act*, the *Executive Council Act*, and the *Members' Retiring Allowances Act*.

By way of a letter dated September 7, 1990, the Speaker appointed George M. Mitchell and George L. White as Commissioners to carry out the inquiry required by the *House of Assembly Act* and the *Executive Council Act*.

By way of a separate letter dated September 7, 1990, the Speaker appointed George L. White as Commissioner to inquire and report on all matters arising with respect to the *Members Retiring Allowances Act*.

In order to assist the Commission in its duties it has sought comment, advice and assistance from a variety of sources. All of the Members currently serving in the House of Assembly were contacted and advice was sought from some former Members. A public hearing was held after two separate advertisements in all of the daily newspapers in the Province, as well as notice in the weekly press. Notice was also mailed to the Nova Scotia Federation of Labour, the Nova Scotia Union of Municipalities and several Boards of Trade and Chambers of Commerce in various areas of the Province. Oral submissions was made by the Leader of the Nova Scotia New Democratic Party, the Metro Community Law Clinic, Mr. Michael

MacDonald, Mr. James Harding and Mr. G. H. Fitzgerald, all former MLAs, the Nova Scotia Government Retired Employees' Association and Mr. B. A. Redmond.

The Commissioners have met with several members of the House of Assembly and with a number of public servants associated with the work of the House and the Executive Council.

The Commissioners' Report is divided into two sections, that is, "Recommendations", of the Commission which, pursuant to the provisions of Section 55 of the *House of Assembly Act*, have the same force as if they were passed by the legislature, and, "Proposals", which generally deal with matters that have been raised with the Commissioners but with respect to which they have no clear mandate to decide. The Report this year is not unlike those of past years, and there are contained in it as well as Recommendations a number of Proposals for consideration of the Speaker, Government, Members of the Legislature, and the Internal Economy Board.

In other years, the Commissioners have obtained recent information on remuneration and arrangements for support of the legislators in other provinces of Canada from the editors of an annual study, "Canadian Legislatures" published by Robert J. Fleming. This study was not available last year, nor is it available this year. The Secretary of the Commission, Mrs. Joan Kelley, has contacted each of the provincial Legislatures to obtain their most recent information respecting indemnities, allowances, and pension arrangements, and we have relied on this information.

II. INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES: BACKGROUND CONSIDERATIONS

1. Basic Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries For MLAs and Ministers

During the calendar year 1990, a Member of the House of Assembly was entitled to an Annual Indemnity of $30,130 together with an annual expense allowance of $15,065 for a total basic remuneration of $45,195. Under the provisions of the *Income Tax Act* (Canada) the annual expense allowance is not considered taxable income to the Member, and can amount to 50% of a Member's annual indemnity.

In addition, during 1990 salaries were paid to certain Members in relation to the important offices they held, as follows: to the Premier $52,012; a Minister having charge of a Department (i.e., a "Minister with portfolio") $37,055; a Minister without portfolio up to $37,055; the Speaker $37,055; the Leader of the Opposition $37,055; the Deputy Speaker $18,533; and the Leader of a Recognized Party, other than the Opposition, $18,533. The recent history of basic indemnities, allowances and salaries paid to MLAs and salaried Members, since 1983 appears in Appendix G, Table G-1. A comparison of the 1990 arrangements with those prevailing in other provinces appears in Appendix G, Table G-2.

Under provisions of s. 55 the recommendations of the Commission have the same force and effect as if enacted by the Legislature and have effect from the 1st day of January immediately following the year in which the persons are appointed to prepare the Report. Prior to 1984, annual indemnities and allowances for Members, salaries for Officers of the House and for the Leader of a Recognized Party were all prescribed under the *House of Assembly Act*, while all salaries for the Premier and for the Ministers were prescribed under the *Executive Council Act*.

2. Additional Payments to Members for Services in the House

Some Members are assigned additional responsibilities important to the working of the House of Assembly and, consequently, they are entitled to additional remuneration for these responsibilities.

In 1990, such additional payments were as follows: House Leader ($5,000 per annum); Deputy House Leader ($3,000 per annum); House Leader of the Official Opposition ($2,000 per annum); Whip of each Party ($85 per Caucus Member in the House); and Caucus Chairperson of each Party ($85 per Caucus Member in the House). These levels have not varied since 1984, or earlier in some cases. They are presently established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

Somewhat similar arrangements prevail in other Legislatures in Canada. Appendix G, Table G-3 is a summary of the most recent information available to this Commission, which sets forth additional payments paid to elected Members for certain responsibilities in the various Provincial Legislatures.

In the 1986 report, your Commissioners dealt extensively with the question of committee fees and their integration into the Members annual indemnity. As had been noted in earlier reports to the Speaker, there was a strong feeling that the Chairman of a number of committees should be entitled to additional payments due to the extra work load and time and commitment with which they would be involved.

As authorized by the Internal Economy Board Regulations for 1990, a scale of payment to certain committee chairmen is as follows:

Law Amendments, Legislature Internal Economy Board and Special and Select Committees

- $1,500 for Chairman

Private and Local Bills, Public Accounts, Industry

- $1,000 for Chairman

All Other Committees

- $500 for Chairman

Members are paid a per diem fee of $100 plus reimbursement for travel, accommodation, meals and other reasonable expenses for each day a committee meets when the House is not in session or outside of the Halifax-Dartmouth Metropolitan area if the House is in session.

3. The Legislature and the MLA

As we move into the 1990s, we note that the MLA still has two basic roles. First, the Member is a legislator involved in the increasingly complex tasks of government. Second, the Member is called upon to assist and serve constituents in a multitude of ways and with all kinds of problems, and the Member must respond in a timely and efficient manner.

In the primary role, as legislator, changes in technology, social values, development issues and the rapidity of change itself have made the legislative function a more demanding vocation than it was even a few years ago. Continuing interrelations of federal and provincial governments and their public policies in such a time of change place new demands on private Members, whether in government or in the opposition. The burdens are greater for the Premier and for Ministers who are responsible for governing through the Legislature and for

the administration of government. The role of leaders of opposition parties is also more onerous due to these changes.

The greater complexity of government is not only the result of increasing need for cooperation and coordination between levels of government but also for effective cooperation between the public and private sectors. MLAs are required to become familiar with and deal effectively with a wide range of issues and concerns.

Appendix G, Table G-4, sets out the pattern of legislature sittings over the past sixteen years.

We note that during the annual session of the Legislature, the Members often sit on committees. As well, the Legislature itself may sit for 10 to 12 hours per day if House hours are extended. In 1988 there were 19 days during which the House hours were extended. In 1989 there were 28 such days, and in 1990, 29 such days. The Members must also deal with their constituency responsibilities during the evenings and on weekends. Most Members are absent from their homes and families during the Legislature session which is a sacrifice to public service experienced by the families of all elected Members. The table below shows the number of acts passed by elected Members for each of the last eight years.

TABLE A

ACTS PASSED BY THE LEGISLATURE, NOVA SCOTIA

	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989	1990
Public	67	67	41	65	93	72	82	45
Total	100	90	72	104	127	78	109	77

In addition to their role in the House itself, Members also serve on standing, select or special committees. Members of the Executive Council and Officers of the House have continuing responsibilities for policy and administration even when the House is not in session. Opposition Members generally have responsibility for monitoring and commenting upon particular aspects of government policy and practice, and not only when the House is in session. Members of all parties in the House also meet in caucus throughout the year. Thus, in the legislative role, every Member of the House spends considerable time throughout the year on business of the province whether or not the Assembly is in session.

The second role of the MLA is to assist and serve constituents in a multitude of ways. While the constituency "case load" may vary from one constituency to another, and among Members, this general role has continued to grow. Members often now maintain several hundred active files of constituents' problems and concerns. MLAs are expected to deal with all manner of problems including many that are primarily the concern of other levels of government. No doubt the same is true for other elected members of national or local governments, for all seek to serve constituents who cannot be expected to fully understand the responsibilities of each government in our complex federal society.

Service to constituents is rendered year around. For Ministers, assistance with this service is available through the Minister's office staff. For private Members assistance with this service is provided in part through services of the caucus office and in part by limited funds for secretarial assistance in the constituency and often by volunteer family members. For all Members from outside the Halifax-Dartmouth region service often results in a heavy "case

load" of visits and calls on weekends during the period of the year when the House is in session, and regularly through the week when the House is not in session.

A recent phenomenon is that more Members are becoming "full-time Members". They have no second vocation and depend entirely on their income as Members to support themselves and their families. In the present legislature, approximately 80% of the Members are full-time MLAs.

The level of remuneration and of support to the MLA must be sufficient to allow the Member to devote the time and effort required to perform the duties expected of him or her. It should be adequate to permit persons without private means to stand for election and to serve if elected and it should not result in significant financial hardship for those who serve. The principles relating to appropriate levels of remuneration and support set out in the report of an earlier Commission of Inquiry are attached in Appendix H, and we endorse these.

4. Support for Legislators in Other Provinces

The job of the MLA is unlike any other trade or profession. Members must deal with an increasingly wide range of issues and concerns. The Member of the Assembly must act as legislator, negotiator, ombudsman, social worker, public relations officer and perform tasks at almost any hour of the day or night, often seven days a week and nearly 365 days a year. It is a role with no job security beyond the next election, with the Member's tenure of office subject to public endorsement or rejection at the polls every three or four years.

We believe the work cannot be compared to any other job, except that of legislators elsewhere. Thus, there is merit in comparing the role and remuneration of Nova Scotia MLAs to elected Members in similar roles in other provinces. Appendix G, Table G-2, sets out latest

information on the basic indemnity and expense allowance of MLAs in the ten provinces as well as the salaries of certain Members, and Table G-3 is a summary of additional payments for service in the provincial legislatures. This information was obtained by the Secretary to the Commission from all the provincial legislatures in Canada and is effective as of January 1, 1990.

So far as we can judge measures of workload, such as sitting days, bills passed, size of constituency, number of constituents and committees of the House, it would appear that Nova Scotia Members have a workload comparable to other MLAs in most provinces in Canada, with the exception of Ontario and Quebec.

As noted, we have carried out an investigation with respect to the indemnity and allowance that is paid to all other provincial legislators in Canada. Significant increases have taken place in Newfoundland, Alberta, British Columbia and Prince Edward Island. As a result, the remuneration for Nova Scotia MLAs has fallen somewhat below the legislators remuneration in many of the other provinces of Canada.

5. Some Indicators of Recent Economic Changes in Nova Scotia

Since the MLAs role cannot be compared directly with that of any other profession, trade or employment, direct comparisons of remuneration with other groups are inappropriate. Yet the trend of changes in remuneration for others in the province may be useful in considering possible change for MLAs.

In a number of our provinces and in the Federal Parliament, statutory provision is made for automatic annual change in remuneration for Members by formulae related to changes in provincial wages and salaries, or in public service salaries generally or in price or other indexes.

Some indicators of recent economic changes in Nova Scotia appear in Appendix G, Tables G-5 and G-6.

The following table summarizes comparative increases in rates of earnings of certain public sector groups from 1989 to 1990.

TABLE B

Comparison of Some Changes in Earnings, Public Sector, Nova Scotia

	1989 - 1990
Members' Integrated Annual Indemnity and allowance	9.8%
Ministers' Salaries	5%
Public Sector Salaries:	
Civil Service Management Group	7.7%
Deputy Ministers	7.0%
Provincial Judges	9.0%
Teachers	5.1%
Nurses	12%

Another factor for comparison is the rate of inflation. As measured by changes in the Consumer Price Index for Canada, the inflation rate continued through 1990 at a level significantly below that prevailing in the early 1980s. As Appendix "G", Table G-6 indicates, the percentage increase from December 1981 to September 1990 was approximately 52%. We note that over the same period this compares with increases in the integrated indemnity and allowance for MLAs of 37.2% and an increase in salaries of Ministers of approximately 48% for the same period. The annual increase in CPI for Canada for the latest month reported, September 1990, was 4.3% and for Halifax it was 4.8%.

In light of the various background considerations dealt with in this section of this report, we turn now to discussion of arrangements that we recommend should be made for indemnities, allowances and salaries for Members and for Ministers for 1991, and to some

proposals that we believe warrant consideration. The recent history of basic indemnities, allowances and salaries paid to MLAs and salaried Members since 1983 appears in Appendix "G", Table G-1.

III. REMUNERATION OF MLAs

Over the years your Commissioners have based their decision with respect to the remuneration of MLAs on a multitude of factors which have included the Cost of Living Index, remuneration of MLAs in other provinces, recent contract settlements within the Province of Nova Scotia, the concerns expressed to us by members of the general public, the MLAs themselves, and the judgment of the Commissioners. Over the years your Commissioners have offered to meet privately with various MLAs to discuss their concerns, if any, with respect to salaries and, in particular, constituency expenses. We do this by writing an open letter to all Members of the Legislature and there is always noted in the Report the names of those individuals with whom we have met.

A public hearing has always been held with written notice given to political organizations, labour groups, municipal groups, Boards of Trade, and others across the province soliciting their written or oral presentations. All of these factors are then taken into account when a decision is being made as to whether or not an increase is to be provided to MLAs, and if an affirmative decision is made, the amount of such increase.

This year, the Leader of the N.D.P. Party declined the offer to meet privately with your Commissioners and made a submission at the public hearing. It is worth noting that the Leader of the New Democratic Party had met privately with your Commissioners for the preceding seven or eight years. One of the suggestions made by the Leader of the N.D.P. was that the Commission base its recommendations on information submitted to it at the public hearing. This is clearly impossible as a good deal of our information comes from outside Nova Scotia and, in some instances, from staff members of the provincial government.

While it would be possible to require all MLAs to make their submissions at the public hearing, your Commissioners are concerned that the hearings could become nothing but a forum for political opportunism rather than a sincere effort to address the problems being faced by the Commission.

As we have noted in earlier years, the time expended by Members is increasing constantly and at least 80% of the MLAs are working full time in that capacity and have no outside employment. There are still a few Members, particularly in the Metropolitan area, who engage in other activities and there may well be some Members who do possess an independent income from sources which are not known to your Commissioners. We believe it is our job, after appropriate consideration of numerous factors, to arrive at a decision as to what should be paid to MLAs and Ministers of government. We do not believe that it is relevant to that consideration whether or not an MLA or salaried officer receives outside income whether it is derived from investments or other sources. Requirements for this kind of disclosure should and must come from the Legislature itself by way of appropriate legislation.

What would be of real concern to your Commissioners would be the possibility of a conflict of interest situation arising, but we believe it is a matter for the Legislature to determine whether this area of concern is adequately covered by the present conflict of interest legislation.

This year, your Commissioners have conducted a survey of the indemnity and allowances paid to legislators in other parts of Canada and these figures are shown on Appendix "G", Table G-2. A review of this table will indicate that Nova Scotia legislators receive less income than legislators in all provinces with the exception of Manitoba and Prince Edward Island. The annual remuneration for a Nova Scotia legislator is $45,195. In New Brunswick, the legislator's remuneration is $50,130 and in Newfoundland $53,800.

As noted in last year's Report, the increases in legislator's salaries during the past several years have been relatively small. Notwithstanding the more significant increase provided to legislators for 1990, they are still well behind a cumulative total of CPI increases over the last several years.

It has been suggested to your Commissioners that all MLAs and Cabinet Ministers should have their salaries indexed to the annual increase in the average industrial wage within Nova Scotia. We believe that this type of annual increase would result in much higher salaries than has heretofore been the case. Your Commissioners believe that during a period of severe economic restraint when all segments of the population within Nova Scotia are being asked to cut back, it would be inappropriate to consider that proposal. Given the present circumstances existing and notwithstanding that there may have been considerable increases in remuneration provided to legislators in the other Atlantic Provinces, your Commissioners do not think that it is appropriate to increase the remuneration of MLAs in Nova Scotia for 1991.

We would therefore recommend:

> R-1 For the year 1991 a Member of the House of Assembly be paid an annual indemnity of $30,130 and an annual allowance for expenses of $15,065.
>
> This represents a 0% increase for the year 1991.

During the course of our inquiry, we received one suggestion relating to the severance provisions of s. 50 of the *House of Assembly Act*. Your Commission has decided not to make any changes to the provisions of this section at the present time.

IV. ADMINISTRATION AND SUPPORT SERVICES

The *House of Assembly Act*, s. 54, authorizes the Legislature Internal Economy Board to make regulations which provide support to Members for work in both their constituencies and Halifax. The regulations for 1990 are annexed hereto in Appendix "D" and Appendix "E". Administration for the payments to Members presently falls under the jurisdiction of the Board and is handled on a daily basis by the administrative staff of the Speaker's office.

The Commissioners have concluded that these funding provisions do not clearly fall within the meaning of "indemnities, allowances and salaries" about which we might make recommendations that would have to be implemented.

However during this inquiry our attention was drawn to several matters to which we shall refer without recommendation. As in past years we shall deal with these items by way of proposal which, we trust, will be considered by the Legislature Internal Economy Board in drafting any changes to their Regulations for 1991.

The measure of support which is currently provided to all Members of the House of Assembly are summarized hereunder although they are dealt with in more detail in Appendix "D". For purposes of expenses, Members are divided into two groups, that is, inside Members and outside Members. An outside Member is defined in the *House of Assembly Act* as a Member who is ordinarily resident within the meaning of the *Elections Act*, more than 25 miles distant from the place where the House of Assembly ordinarily sits.

In recent reports, we have made extensive changes to the level of support provided to members for costs incurred in their constituency. The bulk of these costs relate to the maintenance of constituency offices which would include things like rent, secretarial help, and

equipment. These offices are now, by many Members, considered an essential element of their provision of services to their constituents. This is especially true for full-time Members.

The levels of support in 1990 were as follows:

(a) $2,200 for travel in the constituency of each Member who is not an outside Member;

(b) $3,200 for travel in the constituency of each outside Member;

(c) $300 monthly for constituency expenses without receipts;

(d) $1,800 monthly for constituency expenses with receipts for each Member;

(e) $3,500 for postage;

(f) 52 trips per constituency to the City of Halifax.

After having given the matter considerable thought and having reviewed the levels of support provided in other provinces, and presuming that the Internal Economy Board will continue, in its 1991 regulations, the changes made last year, we propose the following change for items (a), (b), and (d) above:

P-1 The sum of $2,300 for travel in the constituency of each Member who is not an outside Member;

P-2 The sum of $3,400 for travel in the constituency of each outside Member;

P-3 The sum of $1,900 each month for constituency expenses including office space, secretarial assistance, telephone, etc., which must be supported by proper receipts and which may be claimed by each Member.

By virtue of a proposal last year, the Internal Economy Board did agree to provide that Members who wish to rent accommodation would be reimbursed for the actual monthly rental expense up to a maximum of $600 per month or $80 per night multiplied by the number of

nights authorized by s. 7(1) of the Internal Economy Board Regulations. Representations have been made which indicate that not only is this situation rather unsatisfactory, but is far more costly to the government than it should be. Consequently, with respect to the question of leased premises we feel it would be appropriate for an outside Member to have the right to lease premises on a year around basis and to be paid therefor, subject to an appropriate limit which we would suggest at being $700 per month in lieu of receiving the allowances for all sleeping accommodations provided for by the Internal Economy Board Regulations.

We propose that:

> P-4 Outside Members shall be reimbursed for the actual annual rental expense as set out in any Lease entered into by such a Member in the Halifax-Dartmouth Metropolitan Area, up to a maximum of $700 per month in lieu of expenses for accommodation provided to an outside Member by virtue of the Internal Economy Board Regulations, provided, however, that the above limitation in monthly rental recovery shall remain the same regardless of how many Members occupy the leased premises.

In last year's report, we proposed that the Internal Economy Board establish a policy with respect to the cost of equipment and furniture for constituency offices. We note that the Internal Economy Board has dealt with this problem in the 1990 regulation, Section 26.

One of the principal support services for Members which is often overlooked is that provided by the Office of the Legislative Counsel. That office is unique in Canada in that it provides a complete legislative drafting service and advice to government and also to both opposition parties. The Legislative Counsel Office is obligated to prepare the annual digest and consolidation and revision of the Nova Scotia Statutes and to do many other duties as are prescribed by the Attorney General or the Governor in Council. The Legislative Counsel Office

also provides staffing to the Law Amendments Committee and private and local Bills Committees as well as several other standing and select committees.

Your Commissioners have been advised that the size of the staff of the Legislative Counsel has shrunk by two lawyers in the past three years while the volume of work has steadily increased. This has created a serious pressure on those remaining within the office. Over the years the number of government bills has remained rather stable, but the number of private Members bills requiring drafting has tripled over the last few years. This has resulted in a large number of over-time hours on the part of the Chief Legislative Counsel and his legal staff.

We would propose the following:

P-5 That the Office of the Legislative Counsel be reviewed by the Legislature Internal Economy Board and that serious consideration be given to increasing the legal staff or recognizing the over-time hours spent by the Legislative Counsel during the time when the Legislature is in session, or some combination of appropriate measures to resolve this problem.

V. SUPPORT FOR LEADERS OF OPPOSITION PARTIES

The *House of Assembly Act* provides that the Leader of the Official Opposition is to have the benefit of office facilities, equipment, secretaries, a director of research, research assistants and senior assistant. The Legislature Internal Economy Board, by regulation, provides for reimbursement of travel and related expenses of the Leader of the Official Opposition. The regulations further allow that if the Leader of the Official Opposition is an outside Member, he is to receive an allowance equivalent to that provided to a Minister for living expenses within the City of Halifax. Additionally, the Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to a leased motor vehicle on the same basis as a Minister.

The *House of Assembly Act* specifies that the Leader of a recognized party is to be provided with office facilities, a secretary, a research assistant, and a senior assistant. The regulations of the Board also make provision for reimbursement of travel and related expenses of the Leader of a recognized party. Such a "leader of a recognized party" is defined in s. 56 as "the Leader in the House of any party represented by two or more Members other than the Premier or the Leader of the Opposition whose party was a "recognized party" in accordance with the *Elections Act* and had candidates standing for election for three quarters of the seats of Members in the House and whose party received ten percent or more of the votes officially recorded in the latest general election of Members of the House".

Your Commissioners would expect that the sort of assistance provided to Leaders of Opposition Parties would continue to be provided into the future.

VI. SALARIES OF MEMBERS HOLDING OFFICE AND EXPENSES OF MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

This section of the report pertains to remuneration and expenses for those who hold office pursuant to the *Executive Council Act* and to remuneration for those who hold office in the House of Assembly.

The Premier and Ministers of the Crown (including those without portfolio) are paid a salary for their offices in accordance with the *Executive Council Act*. The *House of Assembly Act* provides an annual salary for the Speaker, Deputy Speaker, Leader of the Opposition and the leader of a recognized party. The recent history of salaries for these offices is traced in the reports of earlier Inquiries of this nature. The summary record of salaries paid for these offices in recent years appears in Table C below.

TABLE C

SUMMARY RECORD OF SALARIES PAID TO DESIGNATED OFFICE HOLDERS

1986-1990

	1986	1987	1988	1989	1990
Premier	$41,675	$42,510	$43,785	$45,535	$52,012
Minister with Department	32,300	32,950	33,935	35,290	37,055
Minister without Portfolio	Up to 32,300	Up to 32,950	Up to 33,935	Up to 35,290	Up to 37,055
Speaker	32,300	32,950	33,935	35,290	37,055
Deputy Speaker	16,150	16,475	16,970	17,650	18,533
Leader of the Opposition	32,300	32,950	33,935	35,290	37,055
Leader of Recognized Party	16,150	16,475	16,970	17,650	18,533

We recommend that salaries for the Members of the Executive Council and other Officers be established as follows:

R-2 For 1991 the salary of the Premier, under the *Executive Council Act*, be $52,012.

R-3 For 1991 the salary of a Minister having charge of a Department, under the *Executive Council Act*, be $37,055.

R-4 For 1991 the maximum possible salary for a Minister without portfolio, under the *Executive Council Act*, be $37,055.

R-5 For 1991 the salary of the Speaker, under the *House of Assembly Act*, be $37,055.

R-6 For 1991 the salary of the Deputy Speaker, under the *House of Assembly Act*, be $18,533.

R-7 For 1991 the salary for the Leader of the Opposition, under the *House of Assembly Act*, be $37,055 and for the Leader of a recognized party, under the *House of Assembly Act*, be $18,533.

For other salaried Members for whom salaries or payment for offices are provided under regulation, we recommend:

R-8 For 1991 the salary established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for the House Leader, for the Deputy House Leader, for the House Leader of the Official Opposition, for the Whip of each Party and for the Caucus Chairperson of each Party, in each case, be the same as in 1990.

In accordance with s. 6 of the *Executive Council Act*, all Members of the Executive Council are entitled to payment to indemnify them for reasonable expenses incurred for travelling or otherwise in the discharge of official duties.

All those members of the Executive Council who are outside Members as defined in the *House of Assembly Act*, are entitled to an amount to reimburse them for travelling expenses between Halifax and the constituency and for actual expenses incurred as a result of being in Halifax while a member of the Council. One of the more important allowances provided for

Ministers who are "outside Members" is an allowance for rental of accommodations in Halifax, in recognition of the fact that in most cases their service to the Province requires them to have a second residence. In 1990 up to $14,400 could be recovered for costs incurred for accommodation in Halifax by these Ministers.

We also note that s. 52(2) of the *House of Assembly Act* provides for the reimbursement of the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker for reasonable expenses of travel and accommodation incurred while absent from their ordinary place of residence in connection with the business of the House or as a representative of the House or of the Provice, whether the House is in session or not.

As was stated in the 1985 Report, there are two major benefit programmes provided for the public service which have been made available to Members.

The medical plan for the public service has been made available to Members on the same basis as for public servants and so has the basic group life programme.

In our last three Annual Reports, your Commissioners have commented upon the absence of a long-term disability plan for Members and suggested that such a program should be provided. We are pleased to note that effective December 1, 1989, a long-term disability plan for Members of the Nova Scotia House of Assembly became effective. While this protection hopefully will not be necessary, it is a valuable addition to the support package provided to Members of the House of Assembly.

VII. LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEES AND FACILITIES SUPPORTING THE HOUSE

In 1990 the Standing Committees of the House of Assembly were Law Amendments, Private and Local Bills, Public Accounts, Economic Development, Internal Affairs, Human Resources, Resources, Community Services, and Veterans's Affairs and as well as a Special Committee on Rules and Procedures. We assume that with the new House, similar such committees or more will be struck.

In recognizing the expanding role of committees, the government has converted a large portion of the Dennis Building into first-class facilities for the holding of meetings of committees. One of the difficulties of the existing committee system as perceived by the Commissioners is that while the support staff provided for the use of the facilities is competent and diligent, its numbers may have become insufficient to handle all the demands placed upon them. For example, the Public Accounts Committee is an extremely important committee and its work over a period of time should be of considerable benefit to the public interest. It may well be necessary for this committee to have associated with it a full or part-time research person.

A further example of the expansion of the year around use of committees is the lengthy hearings during the past year of the Law Amendments Committee which has considered several important pieces of legislation which have involved representations from scores of groups and individuals from various parts of the province. We note that the organization of these meetings has been carried out with great skill by the staff of the Committees Office.

Two further very important support facilities for the Members of the House are the Hansard service and the Legislative Library. It may not be common knowledge, but the Nova

Scotia Hansard is the fastest Hansard service in Canada despite the fact that over the past decade its workload in volume of pages has more than quadrupled. Not only does it record the affairs of the Legislature and its committees, but it also provides services to conferences, protocol events, press conferences and research. These "outside" activities in 1990 provided government with recoveries of approximately $250,000.

The activities of the Legislative Library in terms of providing service to the legislators has also expanded dramatically. In the past year, there has been a 43% increase in the total number of MLA requests for information. The Legislative Library has a large number of commercial computer data bases and is currently moving toward an automated library system. We are advised that the work of the staff is extremely heavy and we would suggest to the Internal Economy Board that it closely review the possibility of an addition to the full-time staff of the Library.

VIII. SALARIES FOR OFFICERS OF THE HOUSE

The *House of Assembly Act*, in Part VII, designates four Officers of the House of Assembly. These officers are the Chief Clerk, Assistant Clerk, Legislative Counsel and Sergeant-at-Arms. The Chief Clerk, Assistant Clerk and Legislative Counsel are designated by the Act as appointees of the Governor in Council and under the *Public Service Act* the Sergeant-at-Arms is appointed by the House.

The salaries for all of these officers are presently prescribed by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board. In the case of the Legislative Counsel, historically the salary for this officer was fixed by Governor in Council. Following the Report of the Inquiry Commission of 1983, an Order in Council was passed enabling the salary of this officer to be set by the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

With regard to the other officers, subsection 54(3) of the *House of Assembly Act* provides these salaries to be set by regulation of the Board and the regulation provides that for 1990 the salary of the Chief Clerk is $40,404 and for the Assistant Clerk $34,070.

Your Commissioners suggest that, given the recommendations contained earlier in this Report, the salaries of the Chief Clerk and the Assistant Clerk should not be increased. Consequently with respect to our general recommendations for salary increments, your Commissioners propose that:

> P-6 the salary of the Chief Clerk be set at the amount of $40,404 and that of the Assistant Clerk at $34,070.

Your Commissioners suggest, however, that should a vacancy occur in the position of the Assistant Clerk that the Internal Economy Board review the position in order to ensure that

it is filled in a manner that is economically sound. It may even be feasible for the office of the Assistant Clerk to be filled by an employee of the Legislative Counsel's office.

Your Commissioners also note that the salary of the Sergeant-at-Arms set for 1990 was the amount of $38,000. Your Commissioners have been advised that as a result of inadvertence, this salary was less than the amount paid to the person appointed to the position of Sergeant-at-Arms than had been the case in the preceding twelve months. Your Commissioners also understand that the activities of the Sergeant-at-Arms in dealing with the multitude of protests taking place within and around Province House were exemplary. Given these considerations and the fact that the position of the present incumbent is that of a full-time employee, your Commissioners propose:

P-7 That the salary of the Sergeant-at-Arms be set for 1991 at $40,000.

We also note that the *House of Assembly Act*, s. 65 provides for the reimbursement to the officers of the House as may be authorized by the Speaker or other Member of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for reasonable expenses of travel accommodation or otherwise incurred while absent from their ordinary place of residence in connection with the business of the House or as a representative of the House or of the Province whether the House is in session or not.

IX. CONCLUSION

In the course of our Inquiry a variety of matters were brought to the attention of the Commissioners; not all of these have been dealt with or recorded in this Report. We do record our gratitude to the many who assisted us by oral or written submissions or by giving Commissioners the benefit of considered opinions on matters relevant to this Inquiry.

Your Commissioners are always concerned with the level of salary for Nova Scotia MLAs to ensure that people of high calibre continue to offer themselves as candidates for election to the Nova Scotia House of Assembly. We believe that in the past number of years while increases have not been particularly large and have fallen behind the rate of inflation, they are at a reasonably adequate level, particularly when one considers the amount of constituency support provided to our MLAs.

Governments are in a period of retrenchment and Members of the Legislature have an obligation to their constituents to act in a way which provides an example to others. We think that it is appropriate, given the fact that the MLAs will receive no increase this year in their salary, to comment that this reflects to a large extent the position taken by many of the MLAs who expressed their opinion to your Commissioners.

We continue to believe that it is good policy to ensure that the public is aware of all aspects touching upon the indemnity, allowances and expenses of Members of the Legislature and feel that the present process has achieved this result.

X. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The Commissioners make the following recommendations in their Report, after inquiry, respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the *House of Assembly Act* and the *Executive Council Act*:

R-1 For the year 1991 a Member of the House of Assembly be paid an annual indemnity of $30,130 and an annual allowance for expenses of $15,065. (p. 15)

R-2 For 1991 the salary of the Premier, under the *Executive Council Act*, be $52,012. (p. 22)

R-3 For 1991 the salary of a Minister having charge of a Department, under the *Executive Council Act*, be $37,055. (p. 22)

R-4 For 1991 the maximum possible salary for a Minister without portfolio, under the *Executive Council Act*, be $37,055. (p. 22)

R-5 For 1991 the salary of the Speaker, under the *House of Assembly Act*, be $37,055. (p. 22)

R-6 For 1991 the salary of the Deputy Speaker, under the *House of Assembly Act*, be $18,533. (p. 22)

R-7 For 1991 the salary for the Leader of the Opposition, under the *House of Assembly Act*, be $37,050 and for the Leader of a recognized party, under the *House of Assembly Act*, be $18,533. (p. 22)

R-8 For 1991 the salary established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for the House Leader, for the Deputy House Leader, for the House Leader of the Official Opposition, for the Whip of each Party and for the Caucus Chairperson of each Party, in each case, be the same as in 1990. (p. 22)

XI. SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS

The Commissioners consider that a number of matters which do not clearly fall within their commission "to make an enquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid..." are worthy of further consideration by those responsible for the operations of the House of Assembly. While these are not recommendations to be implemented by the Speaker, the Commissioners, after inquiry, make these proposals:

P-1 The sum of $2,300 for travel in the constituency of each Member who is not an outside Member (p. 17);

P-2 The sum of $3,400 for travel in the constituency of each outside Member (p. 17);

P-3 The sum of $1,900 each month for constituency expenses including office space, secretarial assistance, telephone, etc., which must be supported by proper receipts and which may be claimed by each Member (p. 17);

P-4 Outside Members shall be reimbursed for the actual annual rental expense as set out in any Lease entered into by such a Member in the Halifax-Dartmouth Metropolitan Area, up to a maximum of $700 per month in lieu of expenses for accommodation provided to an outside Member by virtue of the Internal Economy Board Regulations, provided, however, that the above limitation in monthly rental recovery shall remain the same regardless of how many Members occupy the leased premises (p. 18);

P-5 That the Office of the Legislative Counsel be reviewed by the Legislature Internal Economy Board and that serious consideration be given to increasing the legal staff or recognizing the over-time hours spent by the Legislative Counsel during the time when the Legislature is in session, or some combination of appropriate measures to resolve this problem. (p. 19)

P-6 the salary of the Chief Clerk be set at the amount of $40,404 and that of the Assistant Clerk at $34,070. (p. 26)

P-7 That the salary of the Sergeant-at-Arms be set for 1991 at $40,000. (p. 27)

APPENDIX "A"

FOOTNOTES

1. *House of Assembly Act*, R.S.N.S. 1989, c. 210, s. 55. (For text of s. 55, see Appendix "B").

2. See Appendix "B" for letter appointing Commission, with a copy of s. 55 of the *House of Assembly Act*.

3. Information provided by the Office of the Speaker.

APPENDIX "B"

The Speaker

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

PO Box 1617
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 2Y3

902 424-5707

September 7, 1990

Mr. George White, LL.B.
Patterson Kitz
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 1068
Truro, Nova Scotia
B2N 5B9; and

Mr. George Mitchell, Q.C.
Cox, Downie & Goodfellow
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 2380, Station M
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 3E5

Gentlemen:

This will confirm your appointment as Commissioners pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an enquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.

I thank you for your willingness to undertake these duties and can assure you of the full co-operation of the Office of the Speaker in carrying out your work.

I look forward to receiving your report on or before December 1, 1990 as required by the Act.

Yours very truly,

Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker

ARD:nk

APPENDIX "B" - Cont'd

House of Assembly Act, R.S.N.S. 1989,
Chapter 210, S. 155

Inquiry into salaries and allowances

55 (1) The Speaker, after appropriate consultation, shall on or before the first day of October in each year appoint persons to make an inquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under this Act, the *Executive Council Act* and the *Members' Retiring Allowances Act*.

Powers, privileges, immunities

(2) The persons appointed pursuant to subsection (1) shall have all the powers and privileges and immunities of a commissioner under the *Public Inquiries Act* and shall complete their inquiry and deliver their report containing recommendations to the Speaker on or before the first day of December in the year in which they are appointed.

Implementation of recommendations

(3) The Speaker, upon receipt of the report containing the recommendations of the persons appointed pursuant to subsection (1), shall cause the recommendations to be implemented and they shall have the same force and effect as if enacted by the Legislature and shall be in substitution for provisions of this Act, the *Executive Council Act* and the *Members' Retiring Allowances Act*, as the case may be.

Application of recommendations

(4) The recommendations shall apply, from the first day of January immediately following the year in which the persons are appointed to make the report, until subsequently changed.

APPENDIX "C"

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The Commissioners gratefully acknowledge the contributions of those many individuals and organizations who made submissions to them or were helpful when consulted in the course of the Inquiry.

During the course of the Inquiry, advertisements, on two occasions, were placed in all the daily and weekly newspapers in Nova Scotia to advise the general public of the Commission's work and to invite submissions.

Written notice was sent to the Nova Scotia Federation of Labour, the Nova Scotia Union of Municipalities and twelve of the Boards of Trade in the province.

A Public Hearing was held in the Red Chamber of Province House on Thursday, October 25, 1990. This year seven presentations were made to the Commission.

The Commission also met with or exchanged correspondence with a considerable number of people. We acknowledge the very helpful assistance of the following persons:

Honourable Roger S. Bacon
Premier
Province of Nova Scotia

Mr. Ross Bragg, M.L.A.
Cumberland West

Mr. Guy Brown, M.L.A.
Cumberland Centre

Mr. Rodney Caley
Editor-in-Chief
Hansard Reporting Services

Mr. R. Cainey
President
Nova Scotia Government Retired Employees Association
Halifax, N. S.

Mr. Joseph Cameron
Executive Director
Metro Community Law Clinic
Halifax, N. S.

Mr. Delmore (Buddy) Daye
Sergeant-at-Arms and
Chief of Security
House of Assembly

Marie P. Dechman, M.L.A.
Lunenburg West

Honourable Arthur R. Donahoe, Q.C.
Speaker of the House, M.L.A.
Halifax Citadel

Mr. G. H. Fitzgerald
Former M.L.A.
Halifax, N. S.

Mr. Percy J. Fleet
Superintendent of Pension Benefits
Department of Finance

Mr. James Harding
Former M.L.A.
Shelburne, N. S.

Mr. Donald Hubley
Administrative Supervisor
Office of the Speaker

Mr. James Hughes
Vice-President
Nova Scotia Government Retired Employees Association

Mr. James C. Leefe
Private Citizen
Truro, N. S.

Mr. Michael (Mickey) MacDonald
Former M.L.A.
Reserve Mines, N. S.

Mr. Paul MacEwan, M.L.A.
Cape Breton Nova

Honourable Jack MacIsaac
Minister of Mines and Energy, M.L.A.
Pictou Centre

Mr. Vincent J. MacLean
Leader of the Opposition, M.L.A.
Cape Breton South

Mr. Richard Mann, M.L.A.
Richmond

Alexa McDonough
Leader, New Democratic Party, M.L.A.
Halifax Chebucto

Honourable Joel Matheson, Q.C.
Minister of Advanced Education and Job Training, M.L.A.
Halifax Bedford Basin

Margaret Murphy
Legislative Librarian

Mr. B. A. Redmond
Private Citizen
Tantallon, N. S.

S. Myles Rector
Director of Administration
Office of the Speaker

Mr. G. C. Ritcey
Chairman
Bentley's Limited
Truro, N. S.

Honourable Donald McInnes
Minister of Transportation, M.L.A.
Pictou West

Mr. Gordon Sturdy
Director
Public Service Pension Division
Department of Finance

Mr. Graham Walker, Q.C.
Chief Legislative Counsel
Province of Nova Scotia

The Comparative Study, Canadian Legislatures, General Editor, Robert J. Fleming, was not published in 1989, nor was it published in 1990. It was, therefore, necessary to contact the provinces to obtain the information annually provided in Mr. Fleming's comprehensive overview.

The Commissioners wish to thank and acknowledge the assistance and cooperation of the numerous government offices within the Provinces for the information they forwarded.

We would particularly extend our appreciation to the following individuals.

Mr. W. J. David MacNeil
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly
Alberta

Ms. Sandy Wharf
Administrator
Office of the Speaker
British Columbia

Mr. W. H. Remnant
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly
Manitoba

Mr. David L. E. Peterson
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly
New Brunswick

Mr. Bill Murray
Office of the Clerk
Newfoundland

Ms. Gayle Laws
Administrative Assistant
Office of the Clerk
Ontario

Mr. Charles MacKay
Clerk Assistant and
Clerk of Committees
Prince Edward Island

M. Gilbert L'Heureux
Directorate for Parliamentary Relations
National Assembly
Quebec

Mrs. Marilyn Borowski
Saskatchewan Legislative Library
Saskatchewan

The Commissioners acknowledge the assistance in their work of S. Myles Rector and Don Hubley, Office of the Speaker and Ms. Joan Kelly, Legislature Committees Office, who assisted with correspondence, advertising and general inquiries for the Commissioners. Mrs. Kelly served as Secretary/Coordinator to the Commission of Inquiry and assisted with many details which made the preparation of this report far simpler it would have been without the benefit of her knowledge and experience.

APPENDIX "D"

LEGISLATURE INTERNAL ECONOMY BOARD REGULATION

CITATION

1 This Regulation may be cited as *Internal Economy Board Regulation 1990*.

AUTHORITY

2 This Regulation is made by the Legislature Internal Economy Board, pursuant to Section 43 of the *House of Assembly Act*, Chapter 128 of the Revised Statutes, 1967, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 39 of the Acts of 1974 and amended by Chapter 22 of the Acts of 1978-79 and Chapter 28 of the Acts of 1982, subsection (2) of Section 40 of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapters 22 and 28, subsection (1) of Section 40B of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 22 and amended by said Chapter 28, subsection (7) of Section 42 of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapter 22, and Section 6A of the *Executive Council Act*, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 24 of the Acts of 1982.

INTERPRETATION

3 Unless otherwise stated, in this Regulation,

(a) "economy air fare" does not include expenses incurred for the private charter of aeroplanes;

(b) "recognized party" means a party represented by two or more members and which is a recognized party in accordance with the *Elections Act* and had candidates standing for election for three quarters of the seats of members in the House and which received ten per cent or more of the votes officially recorded in the latest general election of the members of the House; and

(c) other words, phrases and expressions have the same meaning as in the *House of Assembly Act*.

HOUSE INDEMNITY-ALLOWANCE-TRAVEL-EXPENSE

Indemnity-Allowance-Salary

4 (1) Each member of the House is entitled during the year 1990 to receive a member's indemnity and allowance in four equal instalments, or where the member so requests in writing of the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board, in twelve or twenty-six equal instalments, each instalment being paid at equally spaced intervals throughout the year.

(2) The Clerk, the Assistant Clerk and the Sergeant-at-Arms are eligible to draw their salaries in the same manner as the members of the House of Assembly.

Franking

5 Each member of the House is entitled to receive $3,500.00 in substitution for the franking privilege and in lieu of expenses incurred on account of postage.

Outside Member Travel

6 Subject to Section 33, each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled to reimbursement for actual travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 34 and incurred in 1990 between the place where the outside member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend sittings of the House.

Outside Member Allowance

7 (1) Each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled for attending a sitting of the House to

(a) an amount of $55.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day that the outside member is in attendance at the House while the House is in session; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for expenses,

(i) with proper receipts for sleeping accommodation charges only, or

(ii) notwithstanding Sections 6 and 33, for travel by the shortest and most convenient route between the place where the outside member is ordinarily resident and the place where the House ordinarily sits at the rate set out in Section 34,

incurred in attending the House while it is in session to a maximum of $80.00 per day.

(2) Notwithstanding clause (b) of subsection (1), if an outside member, other than a member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, leases accommodation in the Halifax-Dartmouth Metropolitan area, that member shall be reimbursed the actual monthly rental expense as set out in the lease or $80.00 multiplied by the number of nights authorized by subsection (1), whichever is the lesser, but under no circumstances shall a member be

reimbursement be made in excess of $600.00 per month for any leased premises regardless of the number of members leasing the premises.

(3) Notwithstanding anything contained in this Section, a member shall not submit a claim for travel more often than once every two weeks in respect of payments to be made pursuant to this Section.

Non-Outside Member and Outside Member of Executive Council Allowance

8 Each non-outside member, and each outside member who is a member of the Executive Council or the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party and not entitled to submit a claim pursuant to Section 7, is entitled to an amount of $40.00, without receipts, for expenses for each day that the member is in attendance at the House while the House is in session.

Committee Fee

9 (1) The Chairman and each member of each Standing, Select and Special Committee of the House and the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to receive a payment of $100.00 for each day on which the member attends a meeting of a Committee or the Board when the House is not sitting or the meeting is held outside the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area.

(2) Notwithstanding subsection (1), no member shall receive more than one payment pursuant to subsection (1) for a day for attending more than one meeting of a Standing, Select or Special Committee of the House or the Legislature Internal Economy Board on the same day at the same place or, in the case of the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area, in the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area.

Committee Chairmen

10 The Chairman of each Standing Committee, each Select Committee and each Special Committee of the House is entitled to payment as follows:

(a) Law Amendments Committee - $1,500.00;

(b) Private and Local Bills Committee, Industry Committee and Public Accounts Committee - $1,000.00;

(c) all other Standing Committees of the House - $500.00;

(d) each Special Committee and each Select Committee - $1,500.00.

Committee Expenses

11 (1) For attendance at a meeting referred to in Section 9, the Chairman or member is entitled to receive reimbursement for

(a) actual expenses incurred in respect of accommodation, meals and other reasonable expenses incurred for the purpose of attending the meeting; and

(b) travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 33.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts; and

(b) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

House Leaders

12 (1) A payment of $5,000.00 shall be made to the House Leader.

(2) A payment of $3,000.00 shall be made to the Deputy House Leader.

(3) A payment of $2,000.00 shall be made to the person recognized by the Speaker as occupying the position of House Leader of the Official Opposition.

(4) The Whip of each recognized party of the House shall receive a payment determined by multiplying the number of members of the party by $85.00.

(5) The Caucus Chairman of each recognized party of the House shall receive a payment determined by multiplying the number of members of the party by $85.00.

(6) In this Section, "member" means a duly elected member of the House but does not include the Speaker.

(7) If a payment is made pursuant to this Section to a member in the capacity of House Leader, Deputy House Leader, House Leader of the Official Opposition, Whip or Caucus Chairman, no further payment may be made pursuant to this Section in respect of that position.

CAUCUS

Caucus Expenses

13 (1) In order to promote the intent of the *House of Assembly Act* with respect to support services for caucus offices during the year 1990, a sum shall be paid, at such level as is determined from time to time by the Legislature Internal Economy Board, to each caucus office set forth below sufficient to provide

(a) the Government Caucus Office with five secretaries, a Director of Research, a Researcher, an Assistant Researcher and an Office Manager;

(b) the Official Opposition Caucus Office with seven secretaries, four researchers, one receptionist and one Office Manager; and

(c) the caucus of the recognized party, namely the New Democratic Party, with one secretary,

and such further sum as is determined from time to time by the Legislature Internal Econony Board in accordance with the budget approved by the House of Assembly .

(2) Members of the Government Caucus, members of the Caucus of the Official Opposition and members of the caucus of each recognized party are eligible for reimbursement, pursuant to subsections (4) and (5), for a maximum of four trips to attend caucus meetings held in the Province outside the City of Halifax during the year 1990.

(3) In lieu of each of one or more of the caucus meetings referred to in subsection (2), members of the Government Caucus, members of the Caucus of the Official Opposition and members of the caucus of each recognized party may be reimbursed in accordance with subsections (4) and (5) and Section 27 for a trip to attend a task force meeting anywhere within the Province where the task force meets in one location only and is for a maximum of two nights.

(4) A member attending a caucus meeting pursuant to subsection (2) or a task force meeting pursuant to subsection (3) is entitled to receive reimbursement for

(a) an amount of $55.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for meals and other reasonable expenses incurred for the purpose of attending the meeting or actual expenses for meals and other reasonable expenses;

(b) actual expenses incurred in respect of accommodation; and

(c) travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 33.

(5) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (4) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts; and

(b) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

Caucus Chairmen - Expenses

14 Where the Chairman of a Caucus is an outside member, that member is entitled to claim and to be paid, in addition to any other expenses allowed the Chairman, the same allowance and reimbursement authorized for an outside member for twelve return trips between the place where the Chairman is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax.

LEADER OF OPPOSITION

Expenses within the Province

15 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition, in carrying out official duties within the Province, is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the Leader and one assistant.

Special Travel

16 In addition to the entitlement authorized by Section 28, the Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the Leader and one assistant in carrying out official duties outside the Province on two separate occasions during the period from January 1, 1990, to December 31, 1990, subject to the restriction that on each occasion reimbursement shall not exceed expenses incurred for travel that includes more than three nights accommodation.

Living Allowance

17 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition, as an outside member, shall receive an allowance equivalent to that provided pursuant to the *Executive Council Act* to members of the Executive Council for living expenses within the City of Halifax.

Motor Vehicle

18 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to a leased motor vehicle on the same basis as is a member of the Executive Council for a government leased or purchased motor vehicle.

LEADER OF RECOGNIZED PARTY

Expenses within the Province

19 A leader of a recognized party in carrying out official duties within the Province is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the leader and one assistant.

Special Travel

20 In addition to the entitlement authorized by Section 28, the leader of a recognized party is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the leader in carrying out official duties outside the Province on two separate occasions during the period from January 1, 1990, to December 31, 1990, subject to the restriction that on each occasion reimbursement shall not exceed expenses incurred for travel that includes more than three nights accommodation.

MEMBER FOR CAPE BRETON NOVA

Support Services

21 (1) The member for Cape Breton Nova shall be provided at the Dennis Building in the City of Halifax with

(a) office space not exceeding three hundred square feet;

(b) one secretary at the Civil Service classification AS(6);

(c) office furniture necessary to furnish the office for the member and one secretary;

(d) one telephone line;

(e) one typewriter; and

(f) reasonable postage.

(2) Should there be any question arising from subsection (1) in respect of the office of the member for Cape Breton Nova concerning

(a) the selection of space;

(b) the level of the secretary within the AS(6) classification;

(c) the selection or amount of furniture;

(d) the selection of a typewriter; or

(e) reasonable postage,

such question shall be determined by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

(3) The member for Cape Breton Nova may incur long distance telephone charges for telephone calls made from the office telephone in respect of House or constituency business.

CHIEF CLERK

Salary

22 The Chief Clerk shall be paid a salary of $40,404.00 per annum.

ASSISTANT CLERK

Salary

23 The Assistant Clerk shall be paid a salary of $34,070.00 per annum.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS

Salary

24 The Sergeant-at-Arms shall be paid a salary of $38,000.00 per annum.

CONSTITUENCY MATTERS

Travel

25 (1) Each member of the House who is not an outside member is entitled to receive $2,200.00 in lieu of expenses incurred on account of travel within the member's constituency.

(2) Each member of the House who is an outside member is entitled to receive $3,200.00 in lieu of expenses incurred on account of travel within the member's constituency.

Services

26 (1) Each member of the House is entitled to receive the sum of $300.00 per month in lieu of expenses incurred on account of services to that member's constituency and a further sum not exceeding $1,800.00 per month for expenses accounted for by proper receipt and incurred on account of services in that member's constituency for the provision of office space, meeting places, equipment, telephone, telephone answering services, advertising and secretarial services.

(2) Where the maximum amount that may be claimed pursuant to subsection (1) is not claimed in any month the unclaimed balance may be claimed in a subsequent month.

(3) Expenses in excess of $500 per year incurred for the purchase of office furniture and equipment are not expenses for which a member may be reimbursed pursuant to this Section.

(4) Expenses incurred for the lease or the lease-purchase of office furniture and equipment are expenses for which a member may be reimbursed pursuant to this Section.

(5) Notwithstanding anything contained in this Section, a member shall not submit more than one expense claim in a month in respect of all payments made pursuant to this Section for a month.

Attendance at Halifax

27 (1) Subject to Section 33, each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $55.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 34 and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for return trips between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend in Halifax other than to attend a sitting of the House or one of its committees.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation unless approved in advance by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

(3) Notwithstanding subsection (2), if an outside member, other than a member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, leases accommodation in the Halifax-Dartmouth Metropolitan area, that member shall be reimbursed the actual monthly rental expense as set out in the lease or $80.00 multiplied by the number of nights authorized by subsection (1), whichever is the lesser, but under no circumstances shall reimbursement be made in excess of $600.00 per month for any leased premises regardless of the number of members leasing the premises.

Attendance at Ottawa

28 (1) Each member is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $80.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for economy air fare, normal airline ground transportation and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for two return trips between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Ottawa to attend in Ottawa on constituency business.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

Attendance Outside the Province Other than Ottawa

29 (1) Where a member is not reimbursed pursuant to Section 28 for any return trips between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Ottawa on constituency business, that member is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $80.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement, in addition to that authorized by clause (a), for economy air fare, normal airline ground transportation and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for one return trip between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and another place in Canada outside the Province to attend that other place on constituency business.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

(3) Notwithstanding subsections (1) and (2), the member is not entitled to an amount pursuant to this Section for economy air fare charges in excess of that to which the member would have been entitled pursuant to Section 28.

Other Attendance Outside the Province

30 (1) Where a member is not reimbursed pursuant to Section 28 for more than one return trip between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Ottawa on constituency business, that member is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $80.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement, in addition to that authorized by clause (a), for economy air fare, normal airline ground transportation and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for one return trip between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and another place in Canada outside the Province to attend that other place on constituency business.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

(3) Notwithstanding subsections (1) and (2), the member is not entitled to an amount pursuant to this Section for economy air fare charges in excess of one-half of that to which the member would have been entitled pursuant to Section 28.

Expenses of Critics

31 Persons occupying the position of critic of a Department or agency of Government are entitled to reimbursement for actual and reasonable expenses for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the critic for attending not

more than two meetings per year within the Province which meetings are necessarily incidental to the duties of the critic if prior approval of the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is obtained prior to the incurring of the expenses.

Legislature Internal Economy Board

32 (1) The Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to a payment of $1,500.00.

(2) The Chairman and each member of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to expenses for meetings of the Legislature Internal Economy Board on the same basis and in the same manner as a member of a committee reimbursed pursuant to Section 11.

GENERAL

Restriction

33 No member shall be reimbursed for travel expenses authorized by Sections 6, 13 and 27 in excess of fifty-two return trips in 1990 between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend in Halifax, other than for attendance at a meeting of a Select Committee, a Special Committee or a Standing Committee.

Calculation of Travel Expense

34 Each outside member of the House, the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition and a leader of a recognized party entitled under the *House of Assembly Act* to receive travelling expenses is entitled to be reimbursed for claimed travelling expenses incurred out of the Consolidated Fund of the Province for travel by the shortest and most convenient route between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the place where the House ordinarily sits or the Committee is meeting at

(a) the rate of 29.1 cents per kilometre; or

(b) the cost of economy air fare plus normal airline ground transportation.

Request for Reimbursement

35 A person who makes a request for payment or reimbursement shall

(a) make the request in writing on the form provided by the Legislature Internal Economy Board;

(b) make the request within six months from the time the payment or claim for which reimbursement is made was incurred or became eligible to be paid;

(c) sign the request and certify that the request is correct; and

(d) forward the request to the office of the Speaker.

Limitation on Reimbursement

36 Notwithstanding anything contained in this Regulation, no member may claim for reimbursement an expense

(a) for which the member is reimbursed pursuant to another regulation or enactment;

(b) paid to the member's spouse, child, parent, brother or sister;

(c) paid to a person living in the same dwelling, as a member of the same household;

(d) paid to any business or on account of property in which the member or those persons mentioned in clause (b) or (c) have an ownership interest.

Payment Approval

37 (1) Directions for payment of indemnities, allowances, payments or reimbursements and approval of requests for payment or reimbursement shall be issued or made by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board, the Vice-chairman or a person designated by the Chairman.

(2) The person who approves a request for payment or reimbursement has the authority to reduce or increase the amount of the payment or reimbursement claimed where that person determines that the amount claimed is in error.

Application

38 All Sections of this Regulation apply from the first day of January, 1990, to the thirty-first day of December, 1990, and are a replacement for provisions in a previous Regulation to the extent that it would otherwise apply to this period.

Approved by the Legislature Internal Economy Board at Halifax, Nova Scotia this 12th day of December, 1989.

Hon. Arthur R. Donahoe, Q.C.
Chairman

APPENDIX "E"

LEGISLATURE INTERNAL ECONOMY BOARD REGULATION

CITATION

1 This Regulation may be cited as *Internal Economy Board Regulation 1990A*.

AUTHORITY

2 This Regulation is made by the Legislature Internal Economy Board, pursuant to Section 43 of the *House of Assembly Act*, Chapter 128 of the Revised Statutes, 1967, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 39 of the Acts of 1974 and amended by Chapter 22 of the Acts of 1978-79 and Chapter 28 of the Acts of 1982, subsection (2) of Section 40 of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapters 22 and 28, subsection (1) of Section 40B of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 22 and amended by said Chapter 28, subsection (7) of Section 42 of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapter 22, and Section 6A of the *Executive Council Act*, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 24 of the Acts of 1982.

INTERPRETATION

3 Unless otherwise stated, in this Regulation,

(a) "economy air fare" does not include expenses incurred for the private charter of aeroplanes;

(b) "recognized party" means a party represented by two or more members and which is a recognized party in accordance with the *Elections Act* and had candidates standing for election for three quarters of the seats of members in the House and which received ten per cent or more of the votes officially recorded in the latest general election of the members of the House; and

(c) other words, phrases and expressions have the same meaning as in the *House of Assembly Act*.

STAFF OF CAUCUS OFFICES

4 Subsection (1) of Section 13 of Internal Economy Board Regulation 1990 made by the Legislature Internal Economy Board on December 12, 1989, is repealed and the following subsection substitution therefor:

13 (1) In order to promote the intent of the *House of Assembly Act* with respect to support services for caucus offices during the year 1990, a sum shall

be paid, at such level as is determined from time to time by the Legislature Internal Economy Board, to each caucus office set forth below sufficient to provide

(a) the Government Caucus Office with five secretaries, one Director of Research, one Researcher, one Assistant Researcher and one Office Manager;

(b) the Office of the Leader of the Opposition and the Official Opposition Caucus Office with nine secretaries, one Director of Research, one Research Assistant, four researchers, one senior assistant or senior secretary, two receptionists, one Office Manager and one Director of Policy and Research; and

(c) the Office of the Leader of a Recognized Party and the caucus office of the recognized party namely the New Democratic Party with one secretary, one research assistant, one senior assistant or senior secretary, one receptionist and one Office Manager,

and such further sum as is determined from time to time by the Legislature Internal Econony Board in accordance with the budget approved by the House of Assembly .

Approved by the Legislature Internal Economy Board at Halifax, Nova Scotia this 17th day of January, 1990.

Hon. Arthur R. Donahoe, Q.C.
Chairman

APPENDIX "F"

LEGISLATURE INTERNAL ECONOMY BOARD REGULATION

CITATION

1 This Regulation may be cited as *Internal Economy Board Regulation 1990B*.

AUTHORITY

2 This Regulation is made by the Legislature Internal Economy Board, pursuant to Section 43 of the *House of Assembly Act*, Chapter 128 of the Revised Statutes, 1967, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 39 of the Acts of 1974 and amended by Chapter 22 of the Acts of 1978-79 and Chapter 28 of the Acts of 1982, subsection (2) of Section 40 of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapters 22 and 28, subsection (1) of Section 40B of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 22 and amended by said Chapter 28, subsection (7) of Section 42 of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapter 22, and Section 6A of the *Executive Council Act*, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 24 of the Acts of 1982.

INTERPRETATION

3 Unless otherwise stated, in this Regulation,

(a) "economy air fare" does not include expenses incurred for the private charter of aeroplanes;

(b) "recognized party" means a party represented by two or more members and which is a recognized party in accordance with the *Elections Act* and had candidates standing for election for three quarters of the seats of members in the House and which received ten per cent or more of the votes officially recorded in the latest general election of the members of the House; and

(c) other words, phrases and expressions have the same meaning as in the *House of Assembly Act*.

REPEAL

4 The heading "MEMBER FOR CAPE BRETON NOVA" immediately preceding Section 21 of Internal Economy Board Regulation 1990 and Section 21 is, effective the day of 22nd, February, 1990, repealed.

Approved by the Legislature Internal Economy Board at Halifax, Nova Scotia this 5th day of February, 1990.

Hon. Arthur R. Donahoe, Q.C.
Chairman

APPENDIX "G"

TABLE G-1

SUMMARY OF INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES FOR
M.L.A.'S SALARIED MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL IN NOVA SCOTIA
1983- 1990

YEAR	Annual Indemnity	Annual Expense Allowance	Speaker	Deputy Speaker	Leader of Opposition	Leader of Recognized Party	Minister without Portfolio	Minister with Portfolio	Premier
1983	$18,656±	$ 9,328	$29,150	$14,575	$29,150	$14,575	$ 7,500 - 29,150	$29,150	$37,630
1984	$19,400 ±	$ 9,700	$30,300	$15,150	$30,300	$15,150	$ 7,500 - 30,300	$30,300	$39,511
1985	$20,280 ±	$10,140	$31,670	$15,835	$31,670	$15,835	$ 7,500 - 31,670	$31,670	$40,860
1986	$27,315	$10,340	$32,300	$16,150	$32,300	$16,150	$ 7,500 - 32,300	$32,300	$41,675
1987	$27,860	$10,550	$32,950	$16,475	$32,950	$16,475	$ 7,500 - 32,950	$32,950	$42,510
1988	$28,695	$10,865	$33,935	$16,970	$33,935	$16,970	$ 7,500 - 33,935	$33,935	$43,785
1989	$28,695	$12,450	$35,290	$17,650	$35,290	$17,650	$ 7,500 - 35,290	$35,290	$45,535
1990	$30,130	$15,065	$37,055	$18,533	$37,055	$18,533	$ 7,500 - $37,055	$37,055	$52,012

± For the years 1983, 1984 and 1985, Committee fees earned on average for each member for service on Committees were $8,300, $8,500, and $6,600 respectively. The "integrated annual indemnity" as referred to in the December 1, 1985 Report of the Commission of Inquiry was $26,956 for 1983, $27,900 for 1984 and $26,780 for 1985.

Appendix "G"
Table G-2

INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES FOR ELECTED MEMBERS BY PROVINCE 1990

(Figures sourced from Provincial Legislatures as of October 31, 1990)

Year	N.S. 1990	N.B. 1990	P.E.I. 1990	NFLD. 1990	QUE. 1990	ONT. 1990	MAN. 1990	SASK. 1990	ALTA. 1990	B.C. 1990
Basic Indemnity	$30,130	$35,807	$32,000	$35,875	$57,260	$43,374	$27,963	$38,546	$38,335	$32,812
Expense Allowance	15,065	14,323	9,700	17,937	10,070	14,548	13,982	7,622	19,168	16,406
Salaries:										
Premier	52,012	48,936	46,000	53,866	60,123	53,425	26,600	54,444	59,858	45,000
Minister with Portfolio	37,055	32,625	37,000	39,053	42,945	31,749	20,600	38,111	47,053	39,000
Minister without Portfolio	Up to 37,055	24,469	N/A	N/A	N/A	15,942	15,600	38,111	20,914	25,000
Opposition Leader	37,055	32,625	37,000	39,053	42,945	37,207	20,600	38,111	47,053	39,000
Leader of Recognized Party	18,533	N/A	N/A	N/A	20,041	25,330	15,600	19,056	20,914	N/A
Speaker	37,055	32,625	15,700	39,053	42,945	23,436	15,500	21,778	47,053	39,000
Deputy Speaker	18,533	16,313	7,900	19,526	20,041	9,808	3,500	8,167	23,526	19,500

Table G-3

SUMMARY OF ADDITIONAL REMUNERATION FOR PARTICULAR RESPONSIBILITIES AND FOR COMMITTEE SERVICE IN THE LEGISLATURE BY PROVINCE

A. Particular Legislature Responsibilities (1990)

Responsibility	N.S.	N.B.	P.E.I.	NFLD.	QUE.	ONT.	MAN.	SASK.	ALTA.	B.C.
Parliamentary Assistant	-	-	-	-	$11,452	$ 9,808	$2,500	$8,167	$11,763	$6,000
Deputy Chair, C'tee of Whole	-	-	-	9,763	-	9,808	2,500	4,084	23,526	3,000
Standing C'tee, Chair	$500 to $1500	-	-	-	20,041	8,827	-	4,084	-	-
Standing C'tee Vice Chair	-	-	-	-	11,012	5,313	-	-	11,763	-
House Leader	5,000	-	5,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Deputy Gov't House Leader	3,000	-	-	-	11,452	-	-	-	-	-
Opposition House Leader	2,000	-	3,500	19,526	20,041	12,127	2,500	8,167	10,000	6,000
Deputy Opposition House Leader	-	-	-	-	8,589	5,995	-	-	-	-
3rd Party House Leader	-	-	-	-	-	10,345	-	-	8,000	-
Chief Gov't Whip	$85/mem.	1,575	3,000	6,000	20,041	12,127	2,500	8,167	8,000	6,000
Asst. Gov't Whip	-	-	-	-	8,589	8,311	-	4,084	6,000	3,000
Chief Opposition Whip	$85/mem.	-	3,000	6,000	17,178	9,297	2,500	8,167	6,000	6,000
Asst. Opposition Whip	-	-	-	-	8,589	5,995	-	4,084	5,000	-
Chief 3rd Party Whip	$85/mem.	-	-	-	5,726	8,367	-	4,084	5,000	-
Asst. 3rd Party Whip	-	-	-	-	-	5,450	-	-	-	-
Caucus Chairperson, each Party	$85/mem.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6,000

B. Remuneration for Committee Service (1990)

In addition to payments for Standing Committee Chairman and Vice-Chairman, noted above, the following summary reflects arrangements reported for service as Members on House Committees:

- per diem - Saskatchewan
- per diem paid when House not sitting in Newfoundland, P.E.I., Nova Scotia, Quebec, Manitoba and Alberta, and in Ontario similar payments when House not sitting or Committees meet away from legislature while the House is sitting.
- per diem expense allowance, non-accountable, paid in New Brunswick.
- established by Order in Council for specific committees in British Columbia - Members usually receive no per diem for committee work.
- Newfoundland provides that members of the Public Accounts Committee receive a stipend of $4,000.00
- In P.E.I. MLA members of Executive Council Committees are paid $10,000.00 per annum.

APPENDIX "G"

TABLE G-4

SITTING DAYS PER SESSION OF THE NOVA SCOTIA LEGISLATURE
1974 - 1990

Year	Assembly	Session	Sitting Days
1974	51st Assembly	1st Session	41 days
1975-76		2nd Session	69 days
1976-77		3rd Session	55 days
1977-78		4th Session	58 days
1978		5th Session	54 days
1978-79	52nd Assembly	1st Session	77 days
1980		2nd Session	64 days
1981		3rd Session	83 days
1982	53rd Assembly	1st Session	87 days
1983		2nd Session	64 days
1984		3rd Session	67 days
1985	54th Assembly	1st Session	50 days
1986		2nd Session	56 days
1987		3rd Session	59 days
1988		4th Session	56 days
1989	55th Assembly	1st Session	72 days
1990		2nd Session	76 days

TOTAL DAYS OF EXTENDED HOURS 1983 - 1989

1984	22 days
1985	16 days
1986	32 days
1987	22 days
1988	19 days
1989	28 days
1990	29 days

Source: The Office of the Speaker of the House of Assembly.

APPENDIX "G"

TABLE G-5

AVERAGE SALARIES OF SELECTED PUBLIC SECTOR GROUPS
NOVA SCOTIA, 1986 - 1990

	Year	Average Salary
DEPUTY MINISTERS	March 30, 1986	$74,456
	March 29, 1987	$77,027
	March 27, 1988	$80,002
	January 1, 1989	$84,172
	January 1, 1990	$90,716
PROVINCIAL JUDGES	April 1, 1986	$61,200
	April 1, 1987	$63,036
	April 1, 1988	$68,000
	April 1, 1989	$89,000
	April 1, 1990	$97,000
CIVIL SERVICE MANAGEMENT GROUP	March 30, 1986	$42,136
	March 29, 1987	$42,820
	April 20, 1988	$43,297
	January 1, 1989	$46,700
	January 1, 1990	$50,288
TEACHERS**	August 1, 1986	$38,064
	August 1, 1987	$40,390
	August 1, 1988	$41,977
	August 1, 1989	$45,461
	August 1, 1990	$47,800
NURSES	March 30, 1986	$29,548
	March 29, 1987	$29,614
	April 20, 1988	$29,420
	March 26, 1989	$32,492
	March 25, 1990	$36,387

** This average includes all vocational and technical school teachers and also all supervisory allowances for principals and supervisors.

Source: Nova Scotia Civil Service Commission, November, 1990

APPENDIX "G"

TABLE G-6

CONSUMER PRICE INDEX FOR CANADA (ALL ITEMS)

1981 - 1990

(1981 = 100)

December	1981	104.7
December	1982	114.4
December	1983	119.6
December	1984	124.1
September	1985	128.0
September	1986	133.3
September	1987	139.3
September	1988	145.0
September	1989	152.6
September	1990	159.1

Cumulative Increase: December 1981 to September, 1990
54.4 index points or 52%

Increase September 1989 to September 1990, All Items Index:

for Canada as a whole	6.5 points or 4.3%
for Halifax	7.12 points or 4.8%

Source: Statistics Canada, *Consumer Prices and Price Indexes*

APPENDIX "H"

Principles Relating to Remuneration and Support for Members and Ministers

Identified in Previous Reports of Commissions of Inquiry in Nova Scotia in 1977 and 1982

The primary rewards in an active life of service to the public are the opportunity to serve and contribute to the resolution of social problems and to the improvement of life for all in the province. In our meetings and discussions with elected members, and former members, we have been impressed with this vision by those who so serve, and by the sincerity with which they approach their task. As in an earlier report, we again underline our considered view that over the years Nova Scotia has been singularly blessed by the willingness of able people to take their part in public life. Many have done so at considerable personal sacrifice for themselves and their families. In recent years, as at other times when remuneration for service in office has fallen behind escalating costs, many have served at substantial financial cost to themselves both in direct costs exceeding their remuneration, sometimes to the extent of several thousands of dollars, and indirect losses of income that might be derived from business, professional practice or other activities if time were not so committed to service in government, the legislature and to constituents.

At any time the financial and other circumstances of life for members elected to the legislature will vary on a personal, individual basis. Fortunately, our legislators do not fit any mold and they represent constituencies which vary in size, in economic circumstances and in social standards. From a variety of backgrounds across the province they together provide assurance that our democratic processes ultimately will work to serve our own long-run interests.

While there is no "standard" M.L.A., we have the task of assessing standards for their remuneration. In our view, that task involves developing a standard for fair and reasonable indemnities, allowances and salaries based on certain principles. Those principles enunciated in previous reports include:

1) remuneration should be adequate in light of the time and responsibilities involved in office, and the risks of disruption of career and personal opportunities so that our political parties and their leaders, upon whom parliamentary government depends, may attract the most able persons among us to seek office and not deter the best of those elected from accepting and continuing full-time service in government;

2) remuneration should be reasonable so that the person who has no personal financial resources except through his vocational earnings, which may be terminated or seriously affected if he is elected, is not dissuaded from seeking office to serve the province merely because of financial circumstances;

3) remuneration should be adequate to ensure that M.L.A.'s and Ministers are supported without unfair financial sacrifice upon them or their families, particularly for those in their prime earning years when family and other obligations are likely to be heavy.

Remuneration and support that is fair and reasonable will not unduly encourage anyone interested primarily in financial reward for the balanced judgment of political parties and of the electorate can be counted upon to reject those not primarily interested in public service. Nor will such remuneration result in any significant financial advantage for any elected member who happens to be comparatively well-to-do, for our progressive income tax structure precludes that result.

In the application of these principles a number of factors have been taken into account in previous studies including:

1) The evolving workload of M.L.A.'s, the House of Assembly and Minister's both in relation to legislative and governmental concerns of the province, and, for each member in service to constituents.

2) Changes in general economic circumstances since the last basic change in indemnities, allowances and salaries – e.g.

   – changes in inflation indexes.
   – changes in wages and salaries in the private and public sectors in the province.

3) Comparisons with levels of similar payments for service in the legislatures of other provinces of Canada.

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

Report

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected
Provincial Officials

November 29, 1990

(Members' Retiring Allowances Act)

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected Provincial Officials

Commissioners:

George M. Mitchell, Q.C.
George L. White, LL.B.

Secretary to the Commission:
Joan M. Kelly

Post Office Box 2630
Station "M"
Halifax, N.S.
B3J 3N5

424-4432

November 29 1990

The Honourable Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker of the House of Assembly
Province House
Halifax, Nova Scotia

Dear Mr. Speaker:

You appointed me as a Commissioner pursuant to S. 55 of the House of Assembly Act, to make an inquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act.

Having completed the inquiry, in fulfilment of the commission assigned, the accompanying report is respectfully submitted.

Yours sincerely,

George L. White
Commissioner

NOVA SCOTIA

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

ON

REMUNERATION OF ELECTED

PROVINCIAL OFFICIALS

NOVEMBER 29, 1990

(MEMBERS' RETIRING ALLOWANCES ACT)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	RETIRING ALLOWANCES IN NOVA SCOTIA	2
III.	COMPARISON WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS	6
IV.	GUIDING PRINCIPLES	9
V.	MATTERS REVIEWED	12
VI.	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	20

APPENDICES

		Page
A.	Footnotes	22
B.	Letter of Appointment of Commission	23

I. INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Section 55 of the House of Assembly Act[1], the Speaker of the House appointed a Commission by letter dated September 7, 1990, "to make an enquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act,"[2] (hereinafter referred to as "the Act").

In the course of the inquiry, the Commission followed the same procedure as outlined in the introduction of the foregoing Report of the Commission of Inquiry respecting the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.[3]

The Superintendent of Pensions for the Province of Nova Scotia, namely Mr. Percy Fleet and the Director of Public Service Pensions, Department of Finance, Mr. Gordon Sturdy, have been of great assistance to the Commission.

The appointment, authorizes under the House of Assembly Act, to make "an inquiry and a report respecting allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act". Accordingly, any Recommendations contained in this Report would be made with the expectation they will be acted upon effective January 1, 1991, pursuant to Section 55 of the House of Assembly Act. Otherwise payments should be made in accordance with the Act and reports of persons appointed in prior years pursuant to S. 55 of the House of Assembly Act.

II. RETIRING ALLOWANCES IN NOVA SCOTIA

The Act provides for a retirement allowance for Members of the Legislative Assembly. For this purpose, the Act establishes an account known as the "Members' Retiring Allowance Account". Members contribute and Government makes an equal contribution and credits interest on the balance in the account from time to time. The Act provides if at any time the account is insufficient to make payment provided under the Act, the account is then to be credited with sufficient funds for this purpose from the Consolidated Fund of the Province.

The "Members' Retiring Allowance Account" as it is referred to in the Act exists only as an accounting statement and does not represent a fund set aside for purposes of paying the retiring allowance. Therefore, the retiring allowance is unlike a pension scheme which is customarily funded from a plan established and maintained by the employer and employees. Nevertheless, the retiring allowance is a form of deferred payment and is presently treated as an employee pension plan for tax purposes.

The Act provides the Minister of Finance shall, as soon as possible after the end of each fiscal year, lay before the House of Assembly a report on the administration of the Act during the preceding fiscal year and shall include a statement of the amounts received by way of contributions and interest, the amounts paid by way of allowances, the number of

contributors, the number of persons receiving allowances, and such other information as the Governor-in-Council prescribes.

It should be noted that several changes have been made over time and the following summary describes the arrangements that now prevail:

Eligibility for an allowance - a Member must contribute to the account and must have served in two General Assemblies for five years or more, must have attained age 50 and ceased to be a Member or be totally disabled, or have died in which case an allowance is payable to a surviving spouse and dependent children. By regulation a person otherwise qualified for an allowance but who has not reached the age of 50 years may elect to take an actuarially reduced pension at an earlier age than 50 years.

Contribution by a Member - A Member contributes at the rate of 10% of the indemnity and annual allowance for expenses paid to him, and salaried Members and Ministers contribute 10% of the salary paid to them for their office.

Years of Contribution and Benefits - The maximum years of contribution to the plan

are 15 years and for Members benefits accumulate, for each year of contribution and service, at the rate of 5% of the average annual indemnity and expense allowance during the last three years of service. The maximum benefit cannot exceed 75% of the average annual indemnity and expense allowance during the last three years of service. Salaried Members and Ministers are entitled to additional allowances accumulating at the same rate (5%) of the average salary payment for the three highest years of salaried service (or if salaried service is less than three years, then the average is that of the actual years served). The total minimum amount of all allowances paid under the Act to a former member or spouse or dependent of a former member is presently $500 per month.

Benefits and the Impact of Inflation - By regulation under the Act, allowances paid have been increased in recent years by applying the same indexing factor as has been applied to pensions payable under the Public Service Superannuation Act.[4] Thus

former Members or their dependents paid an allowance have the benefit of these arrangements to offset, in part at least, the impact of inflation on the benefits paid. Arrangements similar to these are also applied to those entitled to a deferred allowance, so that the deferred allowance increases in the same way as allowances being paid.

Survivors Benefits - Where a Member or a former Member entitled to an allowance dies, his or her surviving spouse is entitled to an allowance of 60% of the allowance payable to the deceased and for each dependent child this ratio is increased by 10% to a maximum of 40% of the allowance.

III. COMPARISON WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS

It is common practice in all legislative jurisdictions in Canada to provide for retiring allowances for former members of the legislature and additional allowances for those who have served in salaried offices, for example, the Prime Minister, Premier, Ministers, Speaker, and Leader of the Opposition. These plans reflect the need to provide adequately for those who have served in elected office, often during their most productive years, usually at the price of foregoing other career opportunities, and generally, once elected are dependent upon the will of the electorate more than on the individual's decision for continuance in elected office.

Arrangements do differ somewhat from one legislative jurisdiction to another, most particularly in relation to:

1) the contribution rate of Members - from 7% in Manitoba and Newfoundland to 11% in the case of the Parliament of Canada;

2) the component of remuneration on which the allowance and contributions are based - in the case of the Parliament of Canada and at least four Legislatures it is the indemnity only, and in the case of up to six others, including Nova Scotia, it is the indemnity and general allowance;

3) the age or formula of age plus years of service at which one qualifies for an allowance, having ceased to be a Member - some jurisdictions have no age requirements, while others utilize a formula of age plus years of service, while others provide for a minimum age before payments can be commenced:

No age requirement

Parliament of Canada

New Brunswick

Years of service plus age

Ontario - years of service plus age equals 55, or upon attaining age 50

Newfoundland - years of service plus age equals 60, for Premier 55

British Columbia - years of service plus age equals 60, or upon attaining age 55

Manitoba - years of service plus age equals 55

Quebec - years of service plus age equals 65 (service after 1/1/88 plus age equals 50)

Age Requirement

Prince Edward Island - age 50

Saskatchewan - age 50

Alberta - age 55

Nova Scotia - age 50

4) the annual rate of accumulation of the allowance and the maximum ratio of allowance to remuneration - here a number of other jurisdictions are roughly comparable to Nova Scotia at a rate of 5% for each year of service for a maximum ratio of 75% of remuneration paid before retirement although arrangements do vary from jurisdiction to jurisdiction.

5) arrangements for a surviving spouse and dependent children - most jurisdictions have arrangements for a reduced payment to a surviving spouse or dependent although the amount and method of determination varies.

IV. GUIDING PRINCIPLES

Four guiding principles form the basis of the review and recommendations in this Report: Financial Security; Public Accountability; Equity; Accessibility.

Financial Security

Retirement plans for elected governmental officials in Canada are in most instances more generous than standard private or public sector career pension plans. Their retiring allowance is intended, in part, to provide some form of financial security for those who serve in elected office. Elected officials interrupt their private life careers, often at considerable financial sacrifice, to serve as Members of the Legislature. Their service is without the security of tenure and in fact is often episodic, lacking in longevity. In order to properly compensate for the resultant financial insecurity and losses retiring allowances to Members must be governed by rules and benefit provisions which are often different from those found in prescribed pension plans. As previously indicated, the obligations for payment of retiring allowances under the Act are not fully funded.

Public Accountability

Consideration of any changes to the arrangements for retiring allowances should be tempered by recognition of a

prevailing effort by governments to exercise fiscal restraint and responsibility. The Commission is pleased to note that officials of the Department of Finance have received advice from actuaries and consultants pertaining to certain financial and administrative aspects of the retiring allowances. It may well be appropriate that legislative or accounting changes be considered to ensure that future liabilities for retiring allowances are recognized as expenses in the year when earned by the members. In the absence of a fully funded plan, a policy of reporting expenses and liabilities as future entitlements accrue would at least ensure members of the Legislature are accountable for the plan in effect during their time of service.

Equity

Equity for all who have in the past or who are presently contributing to the Plan is also an important principle and criteria for consideration when assessing the appropriateness of recommendations for changes to the retirement arrangements. There have been many changes to the Act over a period of several years and it is important to assess the fairness of the impact of these changes to those who served at different times in the past. Reforms of recent years have tended to benefit those who have served more recently, while failing to redress resultant inequities to former Members or their surviving spouses and dependents

except for the base minimum established by recommendations in last year's Report.

Accessibility

It is fundamentally important that service in the House of Assembly, through the nomination and election process, be accessible to the largest portion of the population as reasonably possible. The retiring allowance provisions must be seen, by those who could potentially serve, as offering an appropriate level of financial security to prospective members and their dependent families.

In accordance with these guiding principles, the Commission has considered a number of issues.

V. MATTERS REVIEWED

At present, the retiring allowance can commence as early as the day immediately following the Member's resignation, assuming that the Member is otherwise qualified. The Member accrues service to the end of the month in which he resigns by virtue of receiving payment(s) to the end of the month. The payments apply to the Executive Council salary, annual indemnity and the annual allowance for expenses. Nova Scotia Department of Finance officials indicate that in order to be in strict compliance with the Income Tax Act (Canada)[5], the retiring allowance payment should only commence the first day of the following month. The Commission therefore recommends:

> MRA R 90 - 1
>
> Any allowance payable under the Act commence on the later of either (i) the first day of the month following the date on which the Member has died or ceased to be a Member or become totally disabled; or (ii) the date when the allowance otherwise commences pursuant to the Act.

Numerous submissions were made this year concerning the minimum level of allowances paid to former Members or their families. A minimum amount was established by virtue of last year's Inquiry Commission at $500 per month. This provision offers some relief to those who served in the House many years ago. Those persons whose service has been in recent years have earned allowance entitlements significantly

above $500 per month. Those who served many years ago did so at a time when the MLA was paid comparatively much less than today and consequently not only had they served at great personal financial sacrifice while an MLA, but their retiring allowance was also based on that lower level of pay to MLA's. Taking into account the relatively small and reducing number of individuals who are receiving payments at or slightly above the minimal level, it is recommended:

MRA R 90 - 2

The total minimum amount of all allowances on or after January 1, 1991 paid to a former Member under the Act be the greater of either (i) the amount per month determined in accordance with MRA R 89 - 1, or (ii) an amount per month equal to the product obtained by multiplying the number of years the former Member served as a Member by $50.00, up to a maximum of 15 years.

By virtue of MRA R 89 - 1 (now amended by MRA R 90 - 2) the total minimal amount of all allowances paid on or after January 1, 1991 to a former Member is between $500.00 and $750.00 per month. While the administrative practice presently requires that the former Member must have made all required or optional contributions in respect of salaried income, indemnity and tax free allowance as a condition of being entitled to receive the stated minimum amount, it is advisable that this be clarified and accordingly the Commission recommends:

MRA R 90 - 3

As a condition to entitlement in respect of the total minimum amount to be paid in accordance with MRA R 89 - 1 and MRA R 90 - 2 (including subsequent amendments hereafter), the former Member, the surviving spouse of the former Member, children or dependents of the former Member, or any one of them, must have paid contributions in respect of the former Member for all allowance service components available to that former Member under the Act.

A Member is disentitled from receiving the allowance benefit while he or she is a member of the House of Assembly, except where the Member has attained the age of 71 years, while sitting in the House. Upon ceasing to be a Member, the retirement allowance can then be paid provided the former Member is otherwise eligible. This payment is made without regard to the former Member's personal wealth, subsequent private career achievements or subsequent public appointments.

It has been suggested that a Member, who has ceased to serve in the office of Premier, Leader of the Opposition, Leader of the Recognized Party, Cabinet Minister, Speaker, or Deputy Speaker should receive the portion of his or her retiring allowance relating to the former salaried office if otherwise entitled to the allowance even although still serving in the House. In one sense it is true the components are technically separate, since the retiring allowance on the salary component is calculated for only those years during which the individual served in the salaried office, while the retiring allowance on the MLA's indemnity and tax free

allowance portion is calculated based on the number of years the individual served as a Member of the House. However, the positions are so interrelated it is not appropriate or fair for a person to receive a retiring allowance which relates to holding of salaried office while still receiving remuneration as a Member of the House.

On the other hand, it has also been suggested that a former Member should not receive a retiring allowance while serving as a judge, a Member of the House of Commons, Senate, Legislature of any other Province, a Member of the Federal or any Provincial Public Service or a full time member of a Federal or Provincial Board or Commission. The rational for this position is that there are many other ways in which former MLA's may continue public service and that if they have the good fortune to serve in one of these positions at the public expense they ought not to receive a double benefit from the public.

The latter situation of serving in another public office can be distinguished from the former situation where a person who at one time served in a salaried office continues to sit as an MLA. A pension plan would usually prohibit payments to be made to individuals while still employed with the employer through whom the plan is carried, but on the other hand would permit pension payments to be made to an individual who is otherwise qualified even although he or she may have acquired employment elsewhere. While still

continuing to serve as a Member of the Legislature, even although no longer holding a salaried office, an individual will be enhancing his or her interest in the allowance either by way of additional contributions or by way of potential increment in the average remuneration used as the basis for determining the amount of the deferred retiring allowance.

Further, provided an MLA has served the required time and made the required contributions, that Member acquires a vested interest in his or her retiring allowance. It would not be fair to deprive the individual of this earned retiring allowance simply because the individual has been selected by others to serve in some other public office.

Also, it would be difficult to distinguish between appointments which possibly warrant suspension of payments and those which do not. For example, if a position is on a part-time basis, should the honorarium or part-time fee be deducted? If an individual works for a quasi government body, or private enterprise which is largely funded directly or indirectly from government sources or incentives, should his or her income or equity position be reflected as a reduction in the retiring allowance otherwise payable? In our mixed economy, it is simply not practical to draw a clear line of distinction to identify those who are receiving a "benefit" from the public and those who are not. Presumably, if a former Member is remunerated for service in another position the

level of pay would be commensurate with services performed or the public value of the office held.

For all of these reasons, no recommendation is made for any change in the present arrangements related to these two issues.

It had also been submitted in the course of this year's Inquiry that a former Member be entitled to re-establish his or her interest under the plan notwithstanding the fact that such a former Member previously elected to withdraw his or her entitlement to a deferred allowance. While it is appreciated that personal circumstances may cause a former Member to withdraw from the plan - a decision which for many reasons a former Member may later regret, your Commissioner cannot overlook the fact that the regulations issued pursuant to the Act in 1984 only provide the option to repurchase certain pension benefits to former members who were ineligible for those allowances on ceasing to be a Member. Thus, former Members who were eligible upon ceasing to be a Member and withdrew from the plan did not qualify. It may well be beyond the authority of this Commission to deal with this situation.

The Plan to which Members contribute under the Act and out of which payments are made to former Members, spouses or dependents, is presently registered with Revenue Canada according tc officials of the Nova Scotia Department of Finance. As a result of changes to the Income Tax Act some

provisions of the Act may not be consistent with further requirements for pension plans registered with Revenue Canada.[6] According to officials of the Nova Scotia Department of Finance, chief amongst the differences between the new criteria for pension plans registered with Revenue Canada and the retirement arrangements under the Act are:

1. The benefit to be provided under a registered pension plan in respect of each year of service is not to exceed 2% of the average of the best three years earnings (the Act provides for 5%);

2. Minimum permitted retirement age without actuarial reduction would be 60 except in those cases where a member satisfies the Rule of 80. (MRA R 89 - 7 provides a retirement age of 50);

3. The Member's contribution rate is not to exceed 9% of eligible earnings (MRA R 89 - 9 provides for contributions at the rate of 10%);

The differences listed above are intended as illustrative only, and do not provide an exhaustive comparison between the new requirements for registered pension plans with Revenue

Canada and the current retiring allowance provision for MLA's. In order to maintain the retirement allowance under the Act and utilize the intended provisions of the Income Tax Act to the fullest extent permitted, it may be necessary to arrange for technical or administrative changes in the Act, its regulations or by other means and accordingly, it is recommended:

MRA R 90 - 4

That entitlements accumulate, and allowances be paid to former Members, spouses of former Members, children or dependents of former Members notwithstanding Federal income tax provisions respecting registered pension plans and that the entitlements be accumulated and payments be made in such a manner so as to enable utilization of the provisions of the Income Tax Act (Canada) to continue to the fullest extent possible.

VI. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The Commission make the following recommendations in this Report, after inquiry, respecting allowances to be paid under the Act:

MRA R 90 - 1

Any allowance payable under the Act commence on the later of either (i) the first day of the month following the date on which the Member has died or ceased to be a Member; or (ii) the date when the allowance otherwise commences pursuant to the Act. (Page 12)

MRA R 90 - 2

The total minimum amount of all allowances on or after January 1, 1991 paid to a former Member under the Act be the greater of either (i) the amount per month determined in accordance with MRA R 89 - 1, or (ii) an amount per month equal to the product obtained by multiplying the number of years the former Member served as a Member by $50.00, up to a maximum of 15 years. (Page 13)

MRA R 90 - 3

As a condition to entitlement in respect of the total minimum amount to be paid in accordance with MRA R 89 - 1 and MRA R 90 - 2 (including subsequent amendments hereafter), the former Member, the surviving spouse of the former Member, children or dependents of the former Member, or any one of them, must have paid contributions in respect of the former Member for all allowance service components available to that former Member under the Act. (Page 14)

MRA R 90 - 4

That entitlements accumulate, and allowances be paid to former Members, spouses of former Members, children or dependents or former Members notwithstanding Federal income tax provisions respecting registered pension plans and that the entitlements earned and payments be made in such a manner to enable utilization of the provisions of the Income Tax Act (Canada) to continue to the fullest extent possible. (Page 19)

APPENDIX "A"

FOOTNOTES

1. House of Assembly Act, R.S.N.S. 1989, Ch. 210
2. Members' Retiring Allowances Act, R.S.N.S. 1989, Ch. 282
3. Executive Council Act, R.S.N.S. 1989, Ch. 155
4. Public Service Superannuation Act, R.S.N.S. 1989, Ch. 377
5. Income Tax Act, RSC, Ch. 148 as amended
6. Draft Legislation relating Saving for Retirement Tabled in the House of Commons December 11, 1989

"APPENDIX "B"

The Speaker

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

PO Box 1617
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 2Y3

902 424-5707

September 7, 1990

Mr. George White, LL.B.
Patterson Kitz
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 1068
Truro, Nova Scotia
B2N 5B9

Dear Mr. White:

This will confirm your appointment as Commissioner pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an enquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act.

I thank you for your willingness to undertake these duties and can assure you of the full co-operation of the Office of the Speaker in carrying out your work.

I look forward to receiving your report on or before December 1, 1990 as required by the Act.

Yours very truly,

Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker

ARD:nk